

Thursday, October 28, 2004

Alan, August, Devitch

As you all suspected, your report of the Barnacle Goose, from Feb. 2002 ended up in the Class V category, the dreaded "origins unknown" vote. It was almost a unanimous decision with only 2 PORC members voting Class 1.

I do hope that you do not take this as a confirmation that documenting Barnacle Geese is a futile task as August commented. I would argue the opposite, in that documenting these birds is the only way we will gather enough info to counter the probably false assumption that all records of the species are likely escapes.

Many thanks for making the effort to send in the photos, videos, and written description.

Sincerely

Matt Sharp

Chair: Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee.



115-01-2002

UNUSUAL SIGHTING DOCUMENTATION

Person Submitting: August Mirabella
Address: 1443 Wheaton Lane
North Wales, PA 19454
augustmirabella@aol.com
215-368-0594

Species: Barnacle Goose
Observers: Found by: Fred Tetlow I think
Seen by: ??

Date Seen: 2/8/02-2/19/02 **Time:** 3:00
Where Observed: Ridge Rd., Buckingham Twp., Bucks Co.

Conditions: Sunny

Behavior & Habitat: Feeding & resting in farm field with one Snow Goose & 200 Canada Geese

Description: I have documented these in the past and it is a futile task as long as the species is assumed to be of origin unknown. I am submitting this because of the attached photo. The attached photo & video by Devich Farbotnik to follow clearly indicate the species. I have no idea how we can ever be sure of the origin of these birds. We should probably catch a few and put radio transmitters on them. Unfortunately, if I had to vote, I would vote negative on this particular individual because it was very friendly with a single Snow Goose when seen by most people. Paul Lehman saw it without the Snow Goose on 2/19, so who knows. It was in unworn plumage and was not banded. All the sightings we have had in the county have been with large wintering flocks of migrant Canada Geese during winter or migration.

Similar Species Comparison: Unnecessary-see photo.

Previous Experience: I have seen several over many years locally. They are almost annual here now in the wintering flocks of wintering Canada Geese.

References during ID: None

References after ID: My video

Other Documentation: Photo by Alan Brady attached
PO Box 103 Welcome, PA. 18940
215-598-7856
BirderBrady@aol.com

Video by Devich Farbotnik to be sent directly to PORC
610-504-1715
0341579@storm.bucks.edu

Note: If video is not received in time for review, please contact me as I have video, also

Date of report: 5/2/02

Signature of Observer:



Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

Tabulation Form - Round One

Species: Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis)

Date of Sighting: 8 February 2002 to 19 February 2002

Location: BUCKINGHAM TOWNSHIP

County: BUCKS

Observer(s): Fred Tetlow, Devich Farbotnik, Alan Brady, August Mirabella

Date of Submission: 2002

Submitted by: Alan Brady, August Mirabella, D. Farbotnik

Written Description: Yes

Photo: Yes

Specimen: No

Recording: ~~No~~ Video

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A				Abstain
					Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	
G. Armistead							X	
D. Heathcote							X	
P. Hess							X	
J. Stanley	X							
E. Witmer							X	
R. Leberman	X							
M. Sharp							X	
TOTALS	2						5	
DECISION							X	

Comments: 2/5

Signature (Secretary):



Date:

1/18/03